SALT LAKE CITY PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING Room 126 of the City & County Building 451 South State Street, Salt Lake City, Utah Wednesday, January 23, 2013

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Planning Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at <u>5:36:37 PM</u>. Audio recordings of the Planning Commission meetings are retained in the Planning Office for an indefinite period of time.

Present for the Planning Commission meeting were: Chairperson Michael Gallegos; Vice Chair Emily Drown; Commissioners Lisa Adams, Bernardo Flores-Sahagun, Michael Fife, Clark Ruttinger, and Marie Taylor. Commissioners Angela Dean, Matthew Wirthlin and Mary Woodhead were excused.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were: Wilford Sommerkorn, Planning Director; Joel Paterson, Planning Manager; Casey Stewart, Senior Planner; Michael Maloy, Principal Planner; Ray Milliner, Principal Planner Michaela Oktay, Principal Planner; Michelle Moeller, Senior Secretary and Paul Neilson, City Attorney.

FIELD TRIP NOTES:

A field trip was held prior to the work session. Planning Commissioners present were: Commissioners Michael Fife, Bernardo Flores-Sahagun, Clark Ruttinger and Mary Taylor. Staff members in attendance were Joel Paterson and Michaela Oktay.

The following location was visited:

• Alta Club Parking Structure- PLNPCM2012-00788- The Commission asked questions about the property of the request; the proposed parking structure design, egress, ingress and proposed landscaping. The Commission discussed the proposed landscape trellis/wall along the South Temple Street frontage and the need to screen the parking structure from the right of way. The Commission discussed the importance of the pedestrian experience on South Temple and the existing architecture along the south side of South Temple and noted character defining elements of the architecture.

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FROM THE JANUARY 9, 2013 MEETING

MOTION <u>5:37:23 PM</u>

Commissioner Fife made a motion to approve the January 9, 2013 minutes. Commissioner Taylor seconded the motion. Commissioner Drown abstained from voting. The motion passed unanimously.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR 5:37:47 PM

Chairperson Gallegos stated he had nothing to report at this time.

Vice Chairperson Drown stated she had nothing to report at this time.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR 5:37:55 PM

Mr. Wilford, Sommerkorn, Planning Director, reviewed the Master Planning process that will be the template used for all future master planning processes in the City. He stated the proposal would be brought to the Commission at a future meeting for a briefing. Mr. Sommerkorn reviewed the items the City Council had discussed at their last meeting such as the sign ordinance and on premise signs.

PUBLIC HEARING

<u>5:39:28 PM</u>

<u>PLNPCM2012-00788 Alta Club Parking Structure</u> – A request by the LDS Church for a Conditional Use permit to demolish a principal building (Mr. Mac building) to construct a parking structure that will be used for off-site parking for the Alta Club. The site is located at approximately 160 E. South Temple in a D-1 Downtown Central Business zoning district, and Council District 4, represented by Luke Garrott. (Staff Contact: Michaela Oktay, AICP, at (801) 535-6003 or <u>michaela.oktay@slcgov.com</u>)

Ms. Michaela Oktay, Principal Planner reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated it was Staff's recommendation that the Planning Commission approve the petition as presented.

Mr. Bill Williams, Director of Architecture for the LDS Church, and Mr. Vasilios Prishos, Alta Club President, reviewed the history of the properties and the reasons for the proposal. They discussed how it would add to the area and allow for better use of the properties. They discussed the proposal as stated in the Staff Report and how it would benefit the Property Owners as well as enhance the look of the street.

The Commission and Applicants reviewed the design of the proposed parking structure.

PUBLIC HEARING 5:54:43 PM

Chairperson Gallegos opened the Public Hearing seeing there was no one from the public to speak for or against the petition; Chairperson Gallegos closed the Public Hearing.

DISSCUSSION

The Commissioners and Staff discussed the streetscape along South Temple and how the proposal would address the current urban design to keep with the character of the area.

Mr. Williams reviewed the proposed landscaping between the parking lot and the street that would help disguise the parking lot. He gave the example of the Governor's Mansion and the parking lot behind it. He reviewed the necessity to improve the property and stated they felt this was the best option.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed what could be done to soften the look of the parking lot from the street. The following comments were made:

- The properties are in a very visible part of the city and need to architecturally fit with the surrounding buildings
- It needed to be more than just a hole in the street
- In essence the parking lot was moving from one side of the street to the other so it was not creating a new parking lot in the area
- Putting a wall along the street would not be the safest way to disguise the parking lot
- Proposed landscaping would be similar to that at the Governor's Mansion allowing a soft barrier between the parking lot and the street
- It was better to have a parking lot than an empty retail building
- Current parking lot would become a temporary park and be developed into apartments in the future as the market demanded
- Elk's building needed to be revamped into something more functional
- The property next to the Alta Club did not allow for residential development due to the lot size
- Proposal would enhance the property and develop the area

The Commission discussed if Staff would give the final approval for the screening of the parking lot or if the petition should be brought back to the Planning Commission for review. They discussed the pros and cons of the proposal and what would be best for the two properties.

MOTION <u>6:14:16 PM</u>

Commissioner Fife stated in regards to PLNPCM2012-00788 the Alta Club Parking Structure at 160 E. South Temple, based on the findings listed in the Staff Report, testimony and plans presented, he moved that the Planning Commission approve the proposed Conditional Use Permit with the three conditions listed in the Staff Report. Commissioner Adams seconded the motion.

The Commission discussed adding a fourth condition regarding the design for the area between the parking lot and the street. They discussed the Historic District boundaries in the area.

Commissioner Fife amended the motion to add a fourth condition as follows:

Direct Planning Staff and Urban Design Planner to work with the Applicant to come up to with screening that related to the mass, scale, style, design and architectural detailing of the surrounding structures and allow Staff to give the final approval for the design.

Commissioner Drown seconded the amendment. Commissioner Drown, Fife, Adams, Ruttinger and vote "aye". Commissioner Taylor and Flores-Sahagun voted "nay". The motion passed 4-2.

<u>6:21:51 PM</u>

<u>Liberty Heights Fresh Mixed-use Project</u> – A request by Steven Rosenberg to amend the Central Community Master Plan Future Land Use Map and Zoning Map, and to consider preliminary subdivision amendment approval and Building and Site Design Review for proposed new construction of a residential/commercial mixeduse project located at approximately 1073 East 1300 South and approximately 1290 South 1100 East. The purpose of the amendment is to allow the removal of a single family home and the new construction of a mixed-use building on site. The subject properties are zoned R-1/5,000 (Single Family Residential District) and CN (Neighborhood Commercial) and are located in City Council District 5 represented by Jill Remington Love (Staff contact: Ray Milliner at (801) 535-7645 or ray.milliner@slcgov.com).

• <u>PLNPCM2012-00608 Master Plan Amendment</u> – A request to amend the Central Community Future Land Use Map to change the designation from low density residential to low density residential/mixed-use.

- <u>PLNPCM2012-00610 Zoning Map Amendment</u> A request to amend the Zoning Map from R-1/5,000 (Single Family Residential District) to CN (Neighborhood Commercial).
- <u>PLNSUB2012-00607 Minor Subdivision Amendment</u> A request for a Minor Subdivision Amendment approval to combine the lots into one lot of record.
- <u>PLNPCM2012-00609 Conditional Building and Site Design Review</u> A request for a Conditional Building and Site Design Review that would grant an exception to reduce the required corner side yard setback on 1300 South from fifteen feet (15') to one foot (1') and the front yard setback on 1100 East from fifteen feet (15') to three feet six inches (3'6).

Mr. Ray Milliner, Principal Planner reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff was recommending that the Planning Commission take the following action:

- Forward a positive recommendation to the City Council for the Zoning Map amendment to rezone the portion of the property zoned R-1-5000 to CN.
- Forward a positive recommendation to the City Council for the amendment to the future land use map in the Central Community Master Plan.
- Approve the Conditional Building and Site Design Review application with the conditions in this staff report.
- Approve the Minor Subdivision with the conditions in this staff report.

Mr. Steve Rosenberg, Applicant, via telephone, stated he did not have anything to present.

Mr. Kenneth Pollard, Pollard Architects, stated he did not have anything to present.

PUBLIC HEARING 6:26:44 PM

Chairperson Gallegos opened the Public Hearing.

The following individuals spoke in support of the proposal: Mr. John Francis and Mr. Casee Francis

The following comments were made:

- The project will be a great addition to the neighborhood
- Project would help other business benefit as well

Chairperson Gallegos closed the Public Hearing.

MOTION <u>6:30:02 PM</u>

Commissioner Drown stated regarding PLNPCM2012-00608 and PLNPCM2012-00610, based on the testimony, plans presented, and the findings written in this Staff Report, she moved that the Planning Commission forward to the City Council a positive recommendation to approve the proposed master plan amendment and zoning map amendment for the Liberty Heights Fresh project. Commissioner Taylor seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

MOTION <u>6:31:49 PM</u>

Commissioner Drown stated in regarding PLNSUB2012-00607and PLNPCM2012-00609for the Subdivision and Conditional Building and Site Design, based on the testimony, plans presented (at both meetings), and the findings written in this Staff Report, she moved that the Planning Commission approve the Liberty Heights Fresh project. The proposal meets the standards for a Minor Subdivision Amendment and Conditional Building and Site Design Review subject to the conditions listed in the Staff Report. Commissioner Taylor seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

<u>6:33:22 PM</u>

<u>PLNPCM2009-00484</u> Subdivision Ordinance Amendment – A request by Mayor Ralph Becker, in behalf of Salt Lake City, requesting to amend the existing Salt Lake City Subdivision Ordinance in order to incorporate provisions toward the Mayor's Sustainability Code Initiative and update the subdivision review process with the intent to make it more efficient and comprehensive. The amendment will affect all of Title 20 Subdivisions. Related provisions of Title 21A Zoning and Title 18 Buildings and Construction may also be amended as part of this petition (Staff contact: Casey Stewart at (801) 535-6260 or <u>casey.stewart@slcgov.com</u>)

PLNPCM2009-01339 Site Development Ordinance Amendment - A request by Mayor Ralph Becker, in behalf of Salt Lake City, requesting to amend the existing Salt Lake City Site Development Regulations, particularly those portions dealing with subdivision design, and update the regulations in conjunction and association with the Subdivision Ordinance amendment project. The amendment will affect chapter 18.28 Site Development Regulations. Related provisions of Title 21A Zoning and Title 18 Buildings and Construction may also be amended as part of this **Stewart** (801) 535-6260 petition (Staff contact: Casey at or casev.stewart@slcgov.com)

Mr. Casey Stewart, Senior Planner reviewed the petitions as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission forward a favorable recommendation to the City Council for both petitions.

The Commissioners and Staff discussed the following areas of the proposal:

- If future cul-de-sacs would be an issue- Staff reviewed how cul-de-sacs would be addressed and be encourage to have pedestrian connectivity to their surroundings such as a park or rear access.
- Was the term "Minor Subdivision" being discarded- Staff stated yes the term was going away but anything ten lots or less would follow the Notice of Subdivision Approval process and anything greater than ten lots would go through the Plat process.
- How would one know what the required street widths were for a subdivision if there were no standards Staff stated there are standards but more flexibility was allowed than in the past. He explained the process a subdivision would go through to determine the required street width.
- What brought about the proposed changes Staff reviewed why the proposed changes were being addressed at this time such as the Mayors Sustainability Plan and some issues with the language in the ordinance.
- Was there a limit to the lot consolidation Staff stated in the Zoning Ordinance regarding Single Family and Two family residential districts there is a maximum lot size allowed for new lots which would provide limits to consolidation of new lots. Staff reviewed the regulations on lot consolidation as per the zoning ordinance.
- Are illustrations being provided for the public regarding some of the concepts-Staff stated they would be willing to add illustrations in the final draft.
- Are minimum lot sizes being suggested or is it subject to the individual subdivisions Staff stated the zoning would continue to establish the minimum lot sizes and proposal would be required to follow the process for review and approval.
- Would privately owned streets be included or just City owned streets Staff stated the provisions did not preclude privately owned streets and could be commercial and residential.

PUBLIC HEARING 7:00:37 PM

Chairperson Gallegos opened the Public Hearing seeing there was no one from the public to speak for or against the petition; Chairperson Gallegos closed the Public Hearing.

MOTION <u>7:01:15 PM</u>

Commissioner Fife stated regarding PLNPCM2009-00484, based on the findings listed in the Staff Report and the testimony and plans presented, he moved that the Planning Commission recommend to the City Council approval of the requested subdivision ordinance amendments and related chapter 21A.56 (condominiums) of the zoning ordinance, as proposed. Commissioner Drown seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

MOTION <u>7:02:02 PM</u>

Commissioner Fife stated regarding PLNPCM2009-01339, based on the findings listed in the Staff Report and the testimony and plans presented, he moved that the Planning Commission recommend to the City Council approval of the requested Site Development Regulations amendments, and the codification of the remaining Site Development Regulations into chapter 18.28 of the city code as proposed. Commissioner Taylor seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

<u>7:02:50 PM</u>

Chairperson Gallegos stated the Public Hearing was held at two previous meetings and had been closed therefore, public comments would not be heard for this item.

PLNPCM2011-00640 Form Based Code for West Temple Gateway – Consideration of Forwarding a Recommendation to the City Council. No Public Comments will be Heard – The Salt Lake City Planning Commission will consider a petition submitted by Mayor Ralph Becker to amend the Salt Lake City Zoning Title and Map from D-2 Downtown Support District and RMF-75 High Density Multi-Family Residential District to FB-UN1 and FB-UN2 Form Based Urban Neighborhood District for properties located approximately between 700 South Street and Fayette Avenue (975 South), and between West Temple Street and 300 West Street. The purpose of the zoning amendment is to ensure future development will enhance residential neighborhoods and encourage compatible commercial development in compliance with the City Master Plan. Related provisions of Title 21A Zoning may also be amended as part of this petition. The subject properties are located in Council District 4, represented by Luke Garrott, and Council District 5, represented by Jill Remington Love. (Staff contact: Michael Maloy at (801) 535-7118 or michael.maloy@slcgov.com) Mr. Michael Maloy, Principal Planner reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated it was Staff's recommendation that the Planning Commission forward a favorable recommendation to the City Council.

Commission and Staff discussed the ingress and egress for properties along 300 West and what would be allowed. The Commission and Staff discussed the maintenance of alley ways in the area and how it should be addressed in the ordinance. Staff stated it was a policy issue that needed to be addressed by the City Council. The Commissioners and Staff discussed the need to address these issues and indicate who was responsible to take care of the alley ways.

The Commission and Staff discussed the definition of food processing and if it was correctly used. Staff stated the definition came from the new Land Use Table that was approved by the Planning Commission. They discussed the difference between the definition for food processing and a restaurant.

The Commissioners and Staff discussed if the regulations would transfer to new or future property owners or if other standards would apply. They discussed the compliance regulations and when they would apply to new or future construction.

The Commission and Staff discussed garages on alleys and how to enforce access to those areas. Staff stated it was an enforcement issue and that the City Council would help to address the policy issues included in the proposal.

The Commission discussed adding language to the motion requesting the City Council to review and consider how alley ways are used and maintained.

The Commissioners and Staff discussed if more than a one foot setback should be required for garages. Staff stated one of the reasons behind the proposed one foot setback was so the streetscape along the alley ways would not become unfavorable. They discussed the area and regulations for parking a vehicle in front of the garage and what would need to be addressed to allow such parking. Staff stated most of the concerns would be addressed during the project review period.

MOTION <u>7:29:59 PM</u>

Commissioner Flores-Sahagun stated regarding to PLNPCM2011-00640, based on testimony received, plans presented, and the findings listed within the October 18 Planning Commission Staff Report, He moved that the Planning Commission transmit a favorable recommendation to the City Council relating to Petition PLNPCM2011-00640 to adopt the Form Based Districts ordinance, and amend the Zoning Ordinance Map from D-2 Downtown Support District, RMF-75 High Density Multi-Family Residential District, and T Transitional Overlay District to FB-UN1 and FB-UN2 Form Based Urban Neighborhood District for properties located approximately between 700 South Street and Fayette Avenue (975 South), and between West Temple Street and 300 West Street, excluding properties located between 700 South Street and 800 South Street, and between West Temple Street and 200 West Street, as illustrated in Attachment C – Proposed Zoning Map Amendment.

Commissioner Flores-Sahagun asked to amend the motion to include requesting the City Council to consider the issues with the maintenance of the alley ways.

Commissioner Taylor seconded the motion The motion passed unanimously.

Commissioner Adams abstained from voting as she was not at the Public Hearings regarding the petition.

The meeting adjourned at 7:32:51 PM.